

**Association “Education For All in Kazakhstan”
UNESCO Cluster Office Almaty**

**Establishment of Community Learning
Centres in Kazakhstan
2002-2005**

FINAL REPORT



**Association
«Education For All in Kazakhstan»**



On the outcome of the project “Establishment of Community Learning Centres in Kazakhstan”, 2002-2005

CONTENT

Introduction

1. Objectives of the project and of the report
2. Stages of establishment and development of CLCs
3. Target groups
4. Principal aspects of CLC work
5. Training of facilitators and trainers
6. Objectives of monitoring
 - 6.1. Objectives of monitoring
 - 6.2. Methodology
 - 6.3. Indicators of progress against objectives
 - 6.4. Sources of information
 - 6.5. Actual accomplishment of project work
 - 6.6. Comments and recommendations
7. Round table “Community Learning Centres in Kazakhstan – opportunities for sustainable development” June, 28, 2005, Almaty.
 - 7.1. Aims, expected outcomes and schedule
 - 7.2. Meeting participants
 - 7.3. Summary of presentations
 - 7.4. Outcome of group work
 - 7.5. Summary

Conclusion and recommendations

Annex

Introduction

The project “Establishment of Community Learning Centres (CLCs) in Kazakhstan” was initiated in 1998 by Asia and South Pacific APPEAL Programme of UNESCO, Bangkok with the financial support of Japan and Norway and is being implemented in a number of countries of Asia and South Pacific region, including Bangladesh, Bhutan, Vietnam, India, Indonesia, Iran, Kazakhstan, Cambodia, Kyrgyzstan, China, Lao PDR, Malasia, Mongolia, Philippines, Thailand, Uzbekistan and several others.

In Kazakhstan the project is being implemented since 2002 by Association “Education for all in Kazakhstan” in conjunction with APPEAL and UNESCO Cluster Office, Almaty. At present the main focus of joint activities is aimed at strengthening operation of CLCs to enable them to further enhance their potential, support their institutional development and make an impact on community development.

It's clear that under the transition to the market acquiring skills and competences facilitating adaptation of people to the changing environment have a special importance. As international experience shows, this problem is solved more successfully when people themselves take the responsibility to adjust themselves not expecting from the state solving the range of problems linked to their socio-economic adaptation and welfare. One of the most efficient forms to develop sense of self-fulfillment and self-management with people are Community Learning Centres.

CLC – is a resource and training centre of non-formal education which provides information and carries out various activities (training, cultural, health, ecological and others) for local – urban or rural – population aimed at developing local community based on the needs of local people. Centres provide services of continuous general and vocational education and training to people of all ages to enable them to acquire knowledge and practical skills necessary to improve quality of their life under the new socio-economic situation. These are first of all such aspects of life as improving their education level, qualification, income, psychological and social adaptation, health, preserving environment, development of art and culture.

1. Objectives of the project and of the report

Long-term objective of the project “Establishment of Community Learning Centres in Kazakhstan” – enhance capacity of individuals and local community through implementing training programmes enabling local community people to learn throughout life.

Immediate objectives – to provide permanent access for population, especially rural ones, to training facilities through CLCs to enable them to obtain and update knowledge and skills required for active involvement in the life of the local community, increased employability, self-employment, and therefore for developing the local community.

Objective of the present report – summarising strengths and weaknesses of project implementation, identify unused opportunities and perspectives of CLC development.

2. Stages of establishing and developing CLCs.

Implementation of the project consisted of **three stages**.

During **the first** stage study of state of things was conducted in developing local community through training and learning needs of population. As a result of this stage learning needs of community members were identified based on analysis of results of questioning and conducting round table discussion with the involvement of main stakeholders to discuss the results of study preparing recommendations for international organizations towards establishing pilot CLCs. Among the most demanded aspects of future CLCs work the respondents mentioned developing computer skills, entrepreneurship training, juridical literacy, foreign languages as well as piloting

health and sport centres. As the study has shown population has a strong need in practical, applied skills and knowledge; people clearly understand that education creates a platform for career development.

During **the second** stage a study visit to Uzbekistan was organized to expose representatives of pilot regions from Kazakhstan to the experience of CLCs in this country. 15 people participated in the study visit which took place from 21 to 26, April, 2003. The programme of the study visit included familiarizing the participants with the operation of CLCs in the three oblasts and capital of Uzbekistan and exchange of experience on creating conditions for developing local community. The outcome of the study visit was raising awareness of prospective heads and facilitators of future CLCs on possible forms, location, resource provision and content of programmes provided in the CLCs in Uzbekistan. Specificity of this country is that CLCs were set up in “makhallyas” – groups of people living in the communities and united based on the principle of self-regulation. The majority of them are equipped with computers, located in school buildings and their activity is aimed at training income generation skills.

In the process of **the third** stage pilot CLCs were set up - first 6 CLCs in Zhambil and Almaty oblasts (2003): in the Karabulak village, Eskeldi raion, Amanbokter village, Sarkand raion of Almaty oblast and Kordai, Sortobe and Nogaibai villages of Kordai raion and Taraz city in Zhambil oblast. Later on one more was set up in Karaganda city (2004). The main outcome of the present stage are:

- Selection of venue and where needed refurbishment of premises organized where CLCs were supposed to be located in. Karabulak, Amanbokter and Nogaibai CLCs are located in the premises of the local administration – Akimats; Sortobe CLC in the rural library, Kordai CLC – in the premises of the raion department of labour and social programmes of the raion Akimat, Taraz CLC – in the premises of children’s club, Karaganda CLC – in the premises of VET school #1;
- In accordance with project implementation plan training seminars for CLC heads and facilitators were prepared and conducted (June and September 2003) with the involvement of representatives of Ministry of education and science of Kazakhstan, local administrations, future partners from Kyrgyzstan;
- 7 CLCs are equipped with necessary equipment. They also have Guides on CLC management;
- Key dimensions of CLC operation were identified;
- Monitoring of the activity of CLCs conducted.

3. Target groups

One of the principal target groups of the project are people who for various reasons don’t have access to quality education (for instance, preschool age children, out of school children, unemployed, single women and mothers who have many children, unemployed youth, repatriates, disabled and elderly people).

As the results of monitoring have shown beside the mentioned groups CLCs services are demanded by working people, farmers, heads of rural households, students of local secondary and vocational schools who would like to extend/update their knowledge and skills in the field of computer literacy and entrepreneurship.

4. Principal dimensions of CLC activities

The shape of CLC work profile was influenced by the training programmes organised by the Association “Education for all in Kazakhstan” for CLC heads, facilitators and trainers. In its turn the themes of these programmes was defined based on study of learning needs of local community target groups, including CLC staff. An important place in the range of services

rendered was given to cultural, health and ecological programmes which were demanded by local people. As a result the following dimensions and programmes were identified:

- **Amanbokter CLC:** training computer, sewing, cheese making, and entrepreneurship skills. Sewing goods at the request of individual clients, revival of craftsmanship.
- **Karabulak CLC:** training computer, sewing, cheese making, entrepreneurship skills, sewing goods according to individual and wholesale orders of population and organizations.
- **Kordai CLC:** training computer, sewing skills, culinary (salad making), sewing goods according to individual and wholesale orders of population and organizations.
- **Nogaibai CLC:** training computer, sewing skills, hairdressing saloon, leisure time of preschool children, shoe and furniture repair, developing craftsmanship (working with felt).
- **Sortobe CLC:** training computer, sewing skills, self-learning skills with students and schoolchildren, Kazakh language courses, training farmers, farmers' lessons, implementation of the programme of reviving and developing local cultural traditions, ecological activities (tree planting, home flower growing, sanitary cleaning of territories, healthy life style programmes through centres for organizing public lectures), organization of informal socializing of people, reading periodicals, etc.
- **Karaganda CLC:** developing computer skills (initial and advanced courses), sewing and embroidery skills, life skills (entrepreneurship, employability, psychological and professional adaptation skills), training and retraining vocational skills, organization of "holiday clubs", programme «Health and family planning», ecological programme.
- **Taraz CLC:** developing computer and sewing skills, life skills (entrepreneurship, marketing, employability skills), psychological adaptation of teenagers, tourist business (including training of trainers), motivating young people to learn poetry, organization of leisure time of preschool and school children.

As can be seen from the summary above a wider variation range of services is provided by Karaganda and Sortobe CLCs. Certainly, in cities there are more opportunities to cooperate with other training providers, invite more qualified teachers and trainers having wider profile of training. Besides, the activity of the Karaganda CLC is efficiently supported both by raion and oblast Akimats. Successful activity of this Centre to a considerable extent is a result of effective management style of the head, facilitator and trainers of the CLC. The activity of the Sortobe CLC is supported by the village Akimat, and personally Akim who views human resource development of rural people as one of main principles of his policy.

In other rural CLCs and Taraz city CLC, despite the financial and political support of their activity by local administration, programmes are implemented, as has been mentioned, depending mainly on the content of training managers and trainers at the seminars conducted by Association "EFA in Kazakhstan" in Almaty. Therefore programmes offered by these Centres do not have a wide variety of range (both for content and complexity), to respond to the needs of target groups. The review of these reasons is presented in the section "Conclusions and recommendations".

As recommended in the UNESCO, Bangkok and UNESCO Cluster Office, Almaty methodological materials related to the activity of CLCs, the main focus of action can be in the field of *general and vocational education, improving quality of life, human resource development and economic development of the local community (village, raion, city)*. Review of directions of CLC activities in Kazakhstan during 2,5 years demonstrates that among the four possible areas the most developed one is training dimension.

5. Training of CLC heads and facilitators

This aspect is one of the most important components of the project, as the demand of population for services provided by CLCs, especially in rural regions, depend on the quality and nature of training CLC staff and determine the impact on local community development. In other words,

continuous capacity building of staff through targeted training of heads, managers and trainers – a key condition of their sustainable development.

Our experience shows that subject matter of training, on the one hand, should include management issues (planning, control, analysis, decision making, fund raising, human resource development, etc.); on the other hand – content and methodology of developing knowledge and skills demanded by representatives of local community target groups.

From the moment of setting up CLCs the Association organized several training seminars and consultations within the framework of the project, and organized more than once invitation of CLC representatives of Centres to participation in a number of other training activities, round table meetings and international conferences linked to implementation of projects based on lifelong learning principle, training for local development, life skills development. Altogether during the 2.5 years CLC facilitators and trainers were involved in 10 training and awareness raising activities. Short list of themes, objectives and outcomes of these activities follows¹.

№	Date, venue, form and theme.	Objectives	Outcomes
1.	July, 24, 2002. Almaty. Round table meeting "Establishment of CLCs in Kazakhstan".	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Present the results of situational study of local community members' training needs conducted in the regions of Kazakhstan; • Familiarize the participants with national and international experience in the field of training and local community development; • Develop and discuss recommendations to possible application and dissemination of the experience in other regions; • Discuss and agree target groups whose needs should be addressed by CLCs. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participants familiarized with the report on the results of training needs study; • Recommendations developed to using international experience in setting up CLCs in Kazakhstan; • Plan of actions developed and agreed to setting up and developing CLCs.
2.	June, 14 – 18, 2003, Almaty. Information-training seminar "Organization of the activity of CLCs" (for future CLC heads).	Training on: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Planning and CLC management; • Mobilization and resource management; • Partnership and networking; • Monitoring and assessment ; • Documentation and dissemination; • Capacity building. 	Action plans for the period until the end of 2003 developed, probable problems that might emerge identified, ways to solve them indicated.
3.	September, 2-3, 2003. Almaty. Practical training of CLC heads to work with local population.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Development of CLC action plans for September – December 2003 and 2004. • Discussion of perspectives of CLC development. 	Studied and discussed: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CLC functions on local community development; • Conditions for sustainable development of CLCs; • Approaches to planning and management of CLCs.

¹ Training activities №№ 1-3, 5,6 were conducted within the project "Setting up CLCs in Kazakhstan, №4 - within the framework of the project "Training strategies for local development", № 8 – within the activities of the Association "EFA in Kazakhstan" aimed at implementing the concept of lifelong learning in Kazakhstan, №№ 7, 9,10 – within the framework of the project "Developing life skills in the system of non-formal education".

4.	June, 22, 2004. Almaty. Republican seminar "Training strategies for local development in Kazakhstan: experience, problems, ways to solve them".	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Familiarizing representatives of local authorities, employers, international and non-governmental organizations, training institutions with principal conclusions and recommendations of the project study; • Informing of the experience of local human resources through training; • Discussing approaches to developing policy of human resource development, entrepreneurship, other initiatives through training local community members. 	Key conditions defined for developing and implementing adequate policy (programme) of training local community aimed at improving social and economic situation in specific regions.
5.	June, 23, 2004, Almaty. Information-training seminar "CLCs: first steps and further actions".	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussing interim results of CLC activities. • Identifying needs and challenges facing CLCs. • Defining probable ways of solving problems based on national and international experience. • Assisting strengthening partnership between existing CLCs and other NGOs. 	Organizational, resource, content problems of CLC development and ways to overcome them (based on analytical reports of CLC facilitators).
6.	August, 11-12, 2004, Almaty. Training seminar "Development of knowledge and skills of CLC facilitators to enhance local development".	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Familiarize CLC facilitators with the information on the activity of international organizations and funds active in the field of education in Kazakhstan. • Systematize knowledge and skills of participants to enable them to improve their skills on project proposal development. • Discuss everyday aspects of CLC activities at individual consultations. 	Knowledge and skills of developing project proposals and fund raising skills improved based on the theme "Setting up resource and training centre" for improving information provision of unemployed).
7.	September, 20-25, 2004, Almaty. Training 1 «Preparing CLC trainers to developing life skills with youth and adults".	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Familiarize participants with the concept and structure of life skills, potential of their practical implementation. • Assist in acquiring by CLC trainers skills of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Starting and developing own business. ○ Employability skills; ○ Psychological adaptation to the changing environment. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Awareness raised among CLC trainers on the role of life skills in the life of people and area of their application; • Group of CLC trainers trained to conducting training seminars on developing life skills with local community members; • Draft programmes of training seminars developed for conducting training activities in the CLCs and their adequate information and methodological package.
8.	October, 18-19, 2004, Karaganda. International	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Familiarize with the concept of Lifelong Learning (LL) and discuss a possibility of 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recommendations developed towards

	conference “VET din Kazakhstan in the context of lifelong learning”.	<p>integrating LL in the system of formal and non-formal vocational education.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identify potential role of LL for provision of competitiveness of the workforce on the labour market. • Identify national and regional mechanisms of effective interaction between institutions of formal and non-formal vocational education to achieve objectives of LL. 	<p>implementing the concept of LL for social partners and other stakeholders.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Presentations on various aspects of LL made and discussed.
9.	December, 25-26, 2004, Almaty. Training seminar 2 “Training of trainers for Community Learning Centres (CLCs) to enable them to develop life skills with youth and adults (sewing and cheese making)”.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Building capacity of CLC trainers through training specific sewing and dairy products processing techniques for further developing skills with local community target groups. • Familiarize with principles and methodology of marketing. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Group of CLC trainers trained to develop specific sewing and cheese making techniques. • Range of services to be provided by CLC trainers and facilitators extended. • Draft programmes of training seminars to be conducted in the field and methodological packages extended and complemented.
10.	June, 28, 2005, Almaty. Round table “Community Learning Centres in Kazakhstan – opportunities for sustainable development”	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussing the results of CLC monitoring - 2005. • Identifying draft plan of action of organizations involved to provide sustainable of CLCs in the interests of local community. 	Draft action plan of CLC Committees towards further strengthening training activity of CLCs to contribute to their further sustainable development prepared.

6. Outcomes of monitoring Community Learning Centres (CLCs) in 2005

In an effort to discover the most serious problems of CLCs and unused resources and solve them, monitoring of CLCs activity, based on gathering and analysing information in accordance to project objectives, is planned by the conditions of the project.

6.1. Objectives of monitoring

At the current stage of CLC activity a principal problem and key aspect of their work which need priority attention is their strategic and sustainable development through implementing training services needed for community members. Therefore in conducting the monitoring special attention was paid to implementing the training component as part of the strategic plan of CLCs and fulfillment of training programmes as a follow up of training CLC trainers and facilitators. It was important to assess to what extent the activities proposed by the Association “EFA in Kazakhstan” facilitate sustainable development of CLCs, i.e. to what extent the strategy and content of training were correct. In the process of monitoring abilities of CLC managers and facilitators to plan, establish networking and partnership relations with other organizations and training providers, self-assessment abilities were in the focus of assessment. Special attention was paid whether the CLC personnel studies training needs of local community members.

6.2. Methodology

The principal methods of monitoring were visits to CLCs, observation, study of documents, interviews and meetings with key people (CLC heads and facilitators, CLC Committee members, representatives of target groups), telephone interviews with trainees, meetings with stakeholders and project beneficiaries.

Visits to CLCs were complemented by filling out questionnaires to assess the outcome of training (Annex 1).

6.3. Indicators of progress against objectives

Based on the objectives of assessing CLC activity at the current stage of their development the the following key indicators for monitoring and evaluation were identified:

1. All CLCs have:
 - Data base (socio-economic characteristics) of the local community with a focus on target groups;
 - Analysis of priority training needs of representatives of target groups;
 - Work plans for 2005 reflecting CLC mission, as well as monthly activity plans (i.e. the process of strategic and operational plan is implemented);
 - Training programmes on developing various skills (computer literacy, entrepreneurship and employment skills, psychological adaptation to changing circumstances, etc.) adapted to the needs of target groups.
2. All CLCs have made analysis of own activities for the previous year and identified main focus of activities (primarily training programmes) for 2005.
3. At least 80% of questioned are satisfied with the content, methodology and quality of training.
7. At least 20 % of graduates were able to get employment or start own business.
5. At least 4 leading CLCs have included in their plans strategic measures towards:
 - Strengthening institutional and financial sustainability;
 - Involving volunteers;
 - Improving the activity of CLC Committees;
 - Establishing business contacts with other organizations (training institutions, enterprises).

6.4. Sources of information:

- CLC plans for 2005;
- Programme, training and financial reports;
- Reports on monitoring own activity;
- Log books, photo-materials, lists of participants of seminars, trainings, questioning of trainers and participants, feedback and comments of partner organizations, other documents allowing to get reliable and objective information on project implementation.

6.5. Actual accomplishment of project work (against the planned)

Information on the current situation in the field of training and other types of activities of CLCs is presented in the summary table below.

Matrix of actual accomplishment of project work by CLCs in 2005.

N	Aspects	Sortobe CLC	Nogaibai CLC	Kordai CLC	Karabulak CLC	Amanbokter CLC	Taraz CLC	Karaganda CLC	Conclusion and recommendations
1.	Mission and aims, strategy, work plan - 2005	Mission and aims not defined clearly. No clarity and coherence in the plan. Measures on implementation of the recommendations of monitoring 2004 not developed. Perspective: starting a confectionery and wood work shops. Strengthening focus on autonomous learning.	In 2005 was not updated (due to rotation of CLC facilitator and Akim) Perspective: nomination of new facilitator and development of a programme of further actions)	Plan developed for 0,5 year (not available). Mission, aims, strategy not clear. Measures towards implementation of recommendations of monitoring 2004 are not constructive. Perspective: preparing dough and meat products in winter, signing agreement on sewing working clothes, bed linen for hospital.	No clear definition of mission, strategy of further development. Measures towards implementation of recommendation of monitoring 2004 are not concrete. Perspective: extension of CLC venue, signing agreement with regional department of labour and social programmes for training sewers and sewing various goods.	Mission not defined, no strategic and operational plans of work, strategy of future development not defined. No measures developed as a result of monitoring 2004. Perspective: Implementation of programme for developing national craftsmanship.	No clear mission, aims and strategy of future development. Perspective: conducting Open Days to share information on CLC activities with local community members.	Mission, aims and strategy, work plan for 2005 not developed. Perspective: Strengthening partnership relations with public and private institutions and organisations in Karaganda.	This section is the weakest aspect of CLC activities. Recommendations: 1. Develop plan of activities aimed at solving the problems identified in the process of monitoring. 2. Conduct consultations for facilitators on the mentioned problem during the June 2005 seminar for CLC personnel. 3. Equip facilitators with samples of documents on planning.
2.	Local community target groups (TG), availability (up-dating) of data base on learning needs	Women (housekeepers). Youth (mainly girls). Schoolchildren, farmers. Information on local community members needs not up-dated.	Women (housekeepers). Youth (mainly girls). Schoolchildren, students of the local college, children. No data base on learning needs.	Women (unemployed and housekeepers). Youth (18-25 year olds). Schoolchildren-teenagers, including disabled children. farmers. No data base or instruments on studying learning needs of target groups.	Women-repatriates. Unemployed, unemployed youth, schoolchildren.	Women-housekeepers, schoolchildren, unemployed youth.	Unemployed, women, including elderly ones, schoolchildren , preschool children. No data base on local community, their learning needs.	Unemployed, unemployed youth, schoolchildren, students. Data base and tools to study learning needs of local community target groups available.	5 out of 7 CLCs have general oral information on target groups and their learning needs. Karaganda CLC has data base on learning needs of target groups. Taraz has not accurate information on target groups. Recommendations: organize exchange of experience on creating data base and developing tools for collecting information.
3.	Profile of work (training) based on local community members needs	1. Training computer and sewing skills, self-learning of schoolchildren and students, training of farmers). 2. Culture revival and development of traditions). 3. Ecology (tree planting, household flower growing, sanitary cleaning of territories) 4. Healthy life style (organizing public lectures). Study of local community	1. Training computer and sewing skills), 2. Hairdressing saloon is operation. 2. Various games for preschool children organized. Study of local community learning needs is not conducted.	1. Training computer and sewing skills, culinary). 2. Sewing of goods according to individual requests. 3. Making salads. Study of local community learning needs is conducted occasionally.	1. Training computer and sewing skills, cheese making, developing entrepreneurship skills). 2. Sewing of goods according to wholesale and retail orders. In collecting information on learning needs methods of oral questioning and interviews prevail.	1. Training computer and sewing skills, cheese making, developing entrepreneurship skills). 2. Sewing of goods according to individual requests (initial stage). Information on local community learning needs not available.	1. Training computer and sewing skills, developing life skills. 2. Tourist business, including training of trainers). 3. Culture (motivating young people to learn poetry).	1. Training computer and sewing skills, and embroidery, development of life skills, training and retraining professional skills). 2. Culture (Holiday Club). 3. Health and family planning. 4. Production and sales. 5. Ecological programmes .	Training – is the principal focus of CLC activities. Programmes recommended by Association “EFA in Kazakhstan” on computer and sewing skills, life skills development are fully or partially implemented by all CLCs. Along with training the advanced Centres have introduced additionally programmes demanded by community members (ecological, cultural, aimed at strengthening health). The main challenge – orientation of programmes to community members needs.

		learning needs is conducted.						Study of local community needs is conducted when necessary.	Recommendation: 1. See section 2. Familiarise CLCs with Report of Association "EFA in Kaz" on studying learning needs of community members.
4.	Programmes and methods of training	Training computer skills (36 hours). Sewing (VET school programme – 260 hours). Seminar on developing entrepreneurship skills with women (8 hours). Seminars of developing employability skills and other life skills (4 hours).	Programmes not updated, not adapted to community members needs.	Sewing – programme for 260 hours. Individualized approach. Programme on developing computer skills not finalized.	Multi-level programmes for developing computer skills. The programme on sewing not oriented to the actual level of trainees. Life skills development programmes are not adapted to local needs.	Programmes not presented. The prevailing approach is "Do as I do". Life skills development programmes are not adapted to local needs.	Flexible, original and efficient programmes on sewing (duration from 2-3 weeks to 2 months).	Flexible, multi-level training programmes for various areas of training.	Training programmes developed and available in all Centres. However only individual Centres have made necessary amendments and modifications to adapt to local needs. Recommendations: 1. Introduce different by complexity and duration training programmes, especially on computer skills. 2. Familiarise with the experience of Karaganda CLC on developing multi-level training programmes.
5.	Training groups and schedule of training	Flexible training schedule adapted to local needs (taking into account job specificity and seasonal nature of work).	Group on training sewing – 4 people, training activities organized throughout the week. Training computer skills not regulated.	2 training groups (14 people) on sewing, activities organized throughout the week everyday. Computer skills training – in June only 1 trainee.	Flexible schedule adapted to needs of trainees and taking into account that the venue of the CLC was under repair.	Schedule foresees conducting training activities only one hour a day during 4 days a week (computer skills). Sewing – depending on the demand, not actual training, but income generation activities.	Sewing: 3 groups (6, 4 and 3 people)	All days of the week busy.	All CLCs have schedules of training and implementing other programmes. Some Centres don't operate during week ends. Recommendation: Whenever necessary and possible involve volunteers out of local youth to work in the CLC on week ends.
6.	Trainers	Teachers from local general education and VET schools, trainers invited from the Association of business women, medical workers and experienced specialists.	Teachers from the local school, local specialists.	Teachers from the local schools.	Teachers from the local school, representatives of local community trained by the Association "EFA in Kaz".	Teachers from the local school, representatives of local community trained by the Association "EFA in Kaz".	Permanent list of trainers (5) who have relevant qualification.	4 trainers paid by the city centre of employment, 8 volunteers.	The majority of CLCs don't have funds to cover the salaries of trainers. Recommendation: See section 8. Study international experience of operating institutions of non-formal education.
7.	State of equipment	All equipment is in operational status.	1 computer is not functioning.	2 computers and fax is not functioning.	All equipment is in operational status.	2 computers, fax and modem are not functioning.	2 computers are not functioning.	All equipment is in operational status.	Only in 3 out of 7 Centres all equipment is in operational status.
8.	Partnership and networking	Akimat, secondary school, VET school, local museum, hospital, Association of business women.	Akimat, college, secondary schools, medical centre, Kordai Department of labour and social programmes.	Department of labour and social programmes, schools, hospital.	Raion and village Akimat, Raion Department of labour and social programmes, college, VET school, Trade Union of agricultural workers, secondary	Akimat, Association of innovative schools of the Republic of Kazakhstan, CAMPI, University of Central Asia, secondary school,	Taraz city Akimat, Secondary school #46, VET school #6, NGOs ("Taraz initiative	Oblast, city and raion Akimats, mass media, VET school, Universities, NGO, other centres, and associations.	Partnership and networking in the majority of centres is at the initial stage of development. Recommendation: More frequently conduct information campaigns, consultations to raise awareness of local

					school, Branch of political party "Aul" (Rural community).	Association of mountainous villages.	centre", "School of female leadership», Community Administration		administration, enterprises, other organizations, involve them into the CLC activities.
9.	Monitoring, statistics and self-assessment	Conducted partially. During 2005 over 1,5 representatives of target groups were involved in learning activities.	Not conducted. In 2005 approximately 70 people were involved training activities.	Conducted irregularly. The overall number of people involved in training activities in 2005 is 62.	Conducted. In 2005 over 1000 community members involved were involved in training activities.	Not conducted. In 2005 over 30 people involved in training activities.	Conducted formally. In 2005 approximately 120 people involved in training activities.	Conducted. Since September 2004 755 people trained in the CLC.	The activity of all CLCs on monitoring, self-assessment, study of the efficiency and quality of work, documentation, analysis and reporting needs to be improved cardinally.
10.	CLC Committee	Active, efficient, the composition is optimum.	At present not functioning.	The list is available. No initiatives, proposals, activities.	Potential and resources are not utilized fully, through the composition is optimum.	List of Committee is available, but it is not functioning.	The list is available. No initiatives, proposals, activities.	Active, capable of working, the composition is optimum (7 people).	In 5 out of 7 CLCs Committees are set up formally. The composition and functions of CLC Committees should be aligned in accordance to UNESCO recommendations.
11.	Documentation and stocktaking	Needs further systematization.	In 2005 not updated.	Not kept regularly.	Kept regularly.	Not kept regularly.	Needs further systematization.	Kept regularly.	See section 9.
12.	Dissemination – experience and problems	Experience: productive cooperation with Akimat, education institutions, other organisations. Efficiency of training programmes: upon completion of training in the CLC over 20 families purchased own computers, at present have access to internet and work independently; Some women-house-keepers grow flowers using the expertise gained at training sessions. Challenges: Seasonal employment of local people. Inflexible curriculum on sewing. Difficulties in communicating with Association "EFA in Kaz and other CLCs, various organizations.	Experience: evident interest of Akimat and trainers in developing and strengthening CLC. Challenges: Turn-over of personnel, passiveness of the CLC Committee. Lack of partnership contacts. Poor communication with Association "EFA in Kaz", other CLCs. Lack of financial support from the Akimat.	Experience: good relationship with local community members, Department of labour and education institutions. Challenges: 1. Graduates would like to have certificates, but to have the right to award certificates the Centres need to be registered. 2. Decrease of the number of people involved in training computer skills.	Experience: High level of awareness of the CLC activity and good attendance at training activities. Development of partnership and networking. Multi-level training programmes. Collegiality in making decisions through active involvement of CLC Committee. Challenges: No involvement of volunteers to work with teenagers who have behavioural problems. Lack of marketing studies to extend the range of services provided by the CLC. Lack of financial support from the local administration.	Experience: Involvement of local businessmen into training on promoting healthy life style. Cooperation with international organizations, membership in the Association of mountainous villages. Challenges: Dependence on Akimat in making decisions, passive CLC Committee, lack of initiative on the part of the facilitator.	Experience: Juridical status of CLC, programmes for developing tourism among children. Challenges: Needs of community members not studied. No mechanism of involving local community members in the CLC activities and programmes, poor links between training and tourist programmes. No financial support from the oblast and city Akimats.	Experience: Multi-functionality, activities are demanded by the local community members, involvement of volunteers, political and financial support from the local administration. Challenges: Lack of juridical status.	Strengths of the experience of the majority of CLCs: - cooperation with local administration and training institutions; - services provided are demanded among the local community; - implementation of training programmes recommended by the Association "EFA in Kaz". Weaknesses: - instable financial provision; - lack of planning, strategy of autonomous development; - lack of personal motivation of facilitators in the public work to promote CLC; - lack of conducting needs studies and elaboration of programmes (marketing); - poor conducting monitoring, self-assessment, study of efficiency and quality of training; - keeping documentation and statistics, reporting.

6.6. Comments and recommendations

The review of the data presented in the matrix shows uneven development of CLCs: the Centres having a more efficient political and financial support from local administration are more successful. To these can be referred Karabulak (Almaty oblast), Sortobe and Kordai (Zhambil oblast) and Karaganda city CLCs. Managers (facilitators) of these mentioned Centres included in their annual plans various measures on strengthening institutional and financial sustainability, involvement of volunteers, enhancing the activity of CLC Committees, establishing business contacts with stakeholders. As a result, they cooperate well not only with local administration, but also with education and training institutions (schools, VET institutions, colleges), non-governmental organizations, cultural centres and other structures. Training services of the mentioned above CLCs are demanded by representatives of local communities, first of all, by unemployed, women, youth and schoolchildren. To identify and specify needs of target groups these CLCs conducted targeted questioning and interviews, analysed their results. The most widely disseminated were programmes for developing life skills, within the framework of which trainers and CLC managers were trained. The training activities were organized by the Association "Education for all in Kazakhstan" supported by UNESCO Office, Bangkok and UNESCO Cluster Office, Almaty. During 2005 in various training activities carried out by all CLCs were involved over 3,5 thousand people.

Monitoring has demonstrated that among the most difficult types of work CLC facilitators identified the following ones:

- Strategic and operational planning, identifying CLC mission and objectives;
- Developing data base (socio-economic description) of the local community with special focus on key target groups;
- Identifying priority training needs of representatives of target groups;
- Fund raising activities;
- Self-assessment and keeping statistical data;
- Study of the impact and efficiency of training.

Not all CLCs have done analysis of own activity for the previous year and identified priority areas of action for 2005. It is also quite difficult to identify correctly to what extent the people who were trained in the CLCs are satisfied with the content, methodology and quality of training. Due to the lack of statistics we have to rely on facilitators opinion and assume that approximately 15-20% of graduates who completed training programmes were employed or started own business.

Availability of the mentioned and other difficulties typical for the activity of Centres during the first years are natural and can be explained by the following reasons:

- First, limited human resources. In the situation of non-availability of volunteers in the majority of CLCs it is impossible to carry out the work on numerous directions with the efforts of only CLC head and facilitator (manager);
- Second, not all Akimats under the auspices of which the CLCs are located provide financial support to cover the salaries of facilitators and implement programmes offered. In a number of CLCs it resulted in rotation of facilitators who left for another job;
- Third, despite a number of training seminars organized by Association "Education for all in Kazakhstan" in order to train CLC trainers and facilitators they need further training to be able to accomplish such complex kinds of work like identifying mission and strategy, carrying out needs analysis, self-assessment, fund-raising, etc. (especially in rural regions);
- Fourth, the idea of setting up such Centres based on the feeling of commitment, patriotism, taking responsibility on oneself have not yet become the basic guiding principle in the activity of all CLC Heads, facilitators and trainers. This results in the contradiction between the missions of CLCs as public, community based training and cultural centres and intention of individual facilitators to use the CLC resources primarily for providing chargeable services and earning money.

The experience shows that along with seminars and sharing experience CLC personnel need study visits and secondments to familiarize them with the practice of successful CLCs, as well as more or less frequent (depending on the level of qualification of facilitators) field consultations of experts on the mentioned above most difficult aspects of work. However the Project Terms of Reference do not include such budget items and expenses. Therefore the CLC will have to deal on their own with the problems and challenges identified in the process of monitoring in cooperation with local administration, training institutions, other organizations and stakeholders. Due to the lack of resources the Association is ready to continue providing mainly informational and methodological support.

The national and international experience of developing non-formal education and similar public programmes has proved that for their sustainable operation the following conditions have to be observed:

- Improving the public image of the organization (among citizens, mass media through positive publications, information campaigns, by developing strategies of involving wider community, dialogues on most topical issues of local community development);
- Strengthening political support of state and citizens (contracts, volunteerism, motivated and conscious involvement in committees, councils, etc.);
- Enhancing financial sustainability through contracts with public/non-public organizations and donors, grants, rendering chargeable services, initiatives of social entrepreneurship, charity donations, etc.;
- Strengthening networking, sectoral partnerships, information sharing and coordination between non-commercial NGOs operating in the similar sectors;
- Extending the range of services rendered to target groups of the local community;
- Improving the quality of services (to be judged by service beneficiaries);
- Extending the range of target groups;
- Improving strategic planning, management based on strong leadership, implementation of outcome oriented and client focused management;
- Enhancing the mission measured in terms of increasing the number and quality of interested environment (members, volunteers, service users, social partners) and creating a system needs based operation of CLCs;
- Joining other networks, becoming an integral part of their structures based on principles of efficient management.

As proposed by successful CLCs, there is a need to develop a Statute on CLC as a public non-commercial, not-for-profit entity to enable them to render chargeable training services which operate without profit and therefore void of some types of taxation.

As follows from the mentioned above list of recommendations, there are various possibilities for public organizations enabling them to operate in a sustainable and autonomous way. To achieve this, the organization needs to be led by a head (manager) who has good professional and managerial knowledge and skills, leadership qualities. In our opinion, to cardinaly improve the state of things in the CLCs and support their further autonomous and sustainable development there is a need to organize continuous, recurrent in-depth training of CLC heads and facilitators on the issues mentioned in the recommendations. Additional funding of such a training and field consultations provided by the experts of the Association would have resulted in solving the majority of problems identified during the monitoring mission.

7. Round table “Community Learning Centres in Kazakhstan – opportunities for sustainable development” June, 28, 2005, Almaty.

7.1. Aimes, expected outcomes and schedule.

The present section presents the main conclusions made during the final round table meeting with the involvement of CLC trainers and managers (facilitators) which was dedicated to discussing key achievements and weaknesses of CLC during the last 2,5 years.

The principal objective of the meeting was aimed at discussing the results of the monitoring mission in 2005 and agreeing on the draft plan of joint actions of CLCs and other organizations involved to facilitate their sustainable development at the grass-root level in the interest of local communities. Special attention was devoted to considering opportunities for extending the range of training services.

It was also important to discuss the outcome of the study of the current situation in the CLCs obtained as a result of the monitoring mission, through the analysis of statistics and interim reports prepared by CLCs. The main idea of the monitoring mission was focused at identifying the capacity of CLCs to operate without an external support and to what extent it is feasible. In the process of monitoring there was organized questioning of local community representatives to identify the impact of training conducted by the Association “EFA in Kazakhstan” for CLC trainers and facilitators at the seminars. Un more detail the results of the monitoring mission are reflected in the “Report on monitoring mission”.

The main outcome of the meeting was supposed to be an action plan developed by CLC representatives towards further enhancing the training activity of CLCs to contribute their sustainable development.

The programme was designed as a combination of information sharing and training sessions: presentations were followed by group work, panel discussions, development of draft action plans, etc. (see Annex 2).

7.2. Meeting participants

On the overall 28 people participated in the round table, among them: representatives of the Ministry of education and science, UNESCO Cluster Office, Almaty, oblast and raion akimats, CLC facilitators (managers) and trainers (for list of participants see Annex 3).

7.3. Summary of presentations

In the brief welcome speeches all speakers emphasized the importance of CLCs, topicality of the round table, its focus on summarizing and analysis of the activities.

A. Khalafova, education specialist, UNESCO Cluster Office, Almaty, underlined that setting up and institutional development of CLCs as a tool contributing to increasing quality of local community members life through training. Such attitude to training enables youth and adults, representatives of socially disadvantaged groups of population, especially remote villages to develop their potential, acquire knowledge and skills allowing them to actively participate in the life of the community.

A. Sheshmukhanova, head of unit of developing international programmes, Ministry of education and science, stressed the necessity and possibility to address various needs of people in developing skills through training which help to increase their employability, raise self-confidence and solve problems.

A. Zhaitapova, deputy director of the Republican Institute for improving qualification of teachers, accentuated that such Centres have an important role to play in training young people and adults as they are bringing training closer to place of living.

Having familiarized with the programme of the round table, its objectives and expected outcomes V. Belosludtseva, Expert of the Association "EFA in Kazakhstan", made a presentation on «International experience of developing training and other programmes in CLCs». The objective of the presentation – make the international experience of continuing education which can be best adapted to the national context, available for the seminar participants. The accent in the presentation was made on the methods, techniques, success stories, which could be modified and implemented in the everyday activity of CLCs in Kazakhstan. The speaker made a review of a variety of training programmes, including:

- Continuing education;
- Equivalency programmes ;
- Programmes aimed at improving quality of life;
- Income generation programmes;
- Future oriented programmes ;

Some examples of CLC development from the experience of Asia and Pacific countries were cited.

In her presentation S. Kadyrova summarized the results of CLC monitoring mission which was conducted during 17-23 June, 2005. The monitoring mission was preceded by a big preparatory work. Information letters on the objectives of the monitoring mission, assessment criteria as well as questionnaires for CLC personnel and representatives of the local community were prepared and sent to oblast and raion akimats as well as to CLCs. The outcome of the monitoring mission is presented in a separate report prepared by V. Belosludtseva.

7.4. Outcome of group work

In accordance with the round table programme the participants were proposed to discuss the most acceptable directions of CLC activities in order to identify the problems and strategies linked to their further development and agree on the efficient mechanism of partnership between CLCs, local authorities, NGOs, etc. The participants were split into three groups based on the following principle:

- Group 1 – Karaganda and Taraz (urban);
- Group 2 – Karabulak and Kordai (raion centres);
- Group 3 – Sortobe, Nogaibai and Amanbokter (small villages located in remote regions or far from big villages).

The summary of the group work outcome can be presented as follows.

According to the opinion of the majority of CLC managers and facilitators, **among achievements** can be mentioned the following ones:

- High interest demonstrated by local community members to participate in various programmes offered by CLCs;
- Involvement of business structures in the CLC activities;
- Support provided to CLCs by local authorities (including political support, allocation of funds to cover the salary of facilitators);
- Availability of a legal status;
- Implementation of activities in cooperation with state structures, including mutually beneficial partnership with employment centres on retraining unemployed, contribution of staff, use of facilities belonging to local authorities who host CLCs;
- Participation in the tenders and competitions to win a grant and state orders;

- Variety of training programmes, increasing of their number;
- Right to award certificates upon completion of training programmes;
- Multi-functional range of activities (combination of training, cultural, health and ecological programmes);
- Implementation of the basics of strategic and operational planning;
- Training programmes oriented to the needs of target groups;
- Analysis of the impact of training upon completion of training programmes in terms of employability;
- Suitable location of CLCs for community members to participate in its activities.

Among weaknesses and constraints which require immediate actions were mentioned the following factors:

- Lack of strategic planning, lack of holistic approach to developing plans;
- Lack of understanding among CLC heads and managers (facilitators) of the necessity to identify the mission and long-term aims of CLCs;
- Instable (seasonal) nature of work of individual CLCs;
- Low motivation to increasing their education level and skills development among representatives of vulnerable groups of population;
- Lack of stable communication between CLCs;
- Non-availability or disabled state of communication equipment (Amanbokter, Nogaibai, Sortobe CLCs);
- Lack of variety of training programmes and inflexible schedule of training activities;
- Financial instability;
- Lack of access to low interest (long-term and short-term) loans and other credit sources;
- Non-availability of trainers, volunteers with high qualification; lack of skills to work with adults;
- Inefficient work of CLC Committees, their passive attitude and lack of interest to developing local community;
- High turn over of staff;
- Non-availability of state order for training specialists;
- Insufficient study of the potential and needs of the local community on the part of CLCs;
- Non-availability of the official status of CLCs; lack of juridical skills with CLC heads and facilitators on a wide range of issues related to operation of CLCs;
- Inconsistency and occasional monitoring of job placement of former CLC trainees;
- Lack of juridical status to award certificates or the certificates issued are not recognized as the CLCs have no right to award them;
- Lack of partnership and networking, inability to involve volunteers;
- Lack of awareness among local community members in selected pilot regions of the CLC activities;

Among the risks and challenges that might affect the CLC activities were named the problems linked to:

- Duplication between CLC activities and services provided by the formal system of education;
- Some CLCs might be closed down due to non-availability of sustainable funding;
- Competition caused by other companies and other organizations in big villages and cities;
- Moral and physical deterioration of the equipment available;
- Non availability of umbrella organization to protect CLC interests;
- Forced deviation from CLC mission.

To resolve the key problems affecting future independent development of CLC the participants proposed **the approaches the potential of which was not used sufficiently**:

- Implementation of diverse multilevel training programmes, launching of new training programmes based on local community needs (i.e. poultry breeding, collecting and processing of herbs, food preserving, etc);
- Extending the range of target groups;
- Using the potential of local community human resources, specialists of various profiles, local wisdom, etc. ;
- Using resources of other NGOs, religious, political and commercial organizations located both within as well as outside the community, looking for sponsors, etc.;
- Enhancing contacts with state organizations and institutions;
- Further up-grading qualification of CLC facilitators and trainers, including their self-education and exchange of experience between CLC.

7.5. Summary

Materials of the final meeting of project organizers and CLC representatives have shown that the results of the external assessment (June monitoring mission) and self-assessment done by CLC heads and facilitators are similar. This is a very important result which demonstrates an increased level of analytical skills of CLC heads and facilitators.

The principal positive result of their activity during the last 2,5 year – the training and other services provided to the local community, especially to representatives of disadvantaged groups, are demanded by the beneficiaries. First of all, these are children and youth from families with many children, and women – house keepers and unemployed. Within the period mentioned over 4 thousand people got training in various programmes: computer skills, training unemployed, advocacy and training of healthy life style, massage for disabled children, Kazakh and foreign language courses, processing agricultural products, training of farmers, sewing skills, culinary skills, hairdresser' art, repairing furniture, shoe making and shoe repairing and handicrafts, namely, working with felt and carpet making, organizing leisure time of community members, etc.

Making a reference to the opinion of round table participants we can make a conclusion that sustainability of CLCs would to a great extent depend on the political and financial support of CLCs provided by local authorities, enhancing mutual contacts with enterprises and training institutions, fund raising activities, including offering chargeable services, further training of CLC facilitators to work with community members.

Conclusion and recommendations

Review of the activity of CLCs during 2,5 years shows that despite uneven nature and rate of their development, the Centres have defined their role and niche among non-governmental organisations acting for in the interests of local communities (first of all focused on satisfying training needs). The results of monitoring conducted during 2004 and 2005 show that among **the most successful aspects of their activity** can be mentioned the following achievements:

1. Local authorities are interested in setting up and supporting CLCs. This is proved by their practical political and financial support (especially from Departments of internal policy and centres of labour and social programmes). They have free of charge premises equipped with telephone lines, furniture, other necessary office equipment. Salaries of CLC facilitators are covered by the state (from allocations for public works).
2. At present CLCs have a clear idea what their target groups of the local community are. Their main focus is on disadvantaged groups of people – needy, unemployed people of various age, sex and ethnicity. With the extension of the range of services CLC services attract interest of successful citizens as well.

3. CLCs have developed and implemented from 5 to 10 and more programmes of training, cultural, health and ecological profile which were elaborated based on needs study of target groups of the local community.
4. All Centres have CLC Committees as a consultative joint (corporate) management body to help the CLC heads and facilitators identify needs, problems and resources of community development.
5. Majority of CLCs have established and are strengthening business relations and partnership: first of all, with local authorities, training institutions, organisations of cultural and social sphere, business structures, enterprises, NGOs. Some CLCs were able to mobilise community members, including teachers as volunteers.
6. In 5 out of 7 Centres the staff is made of interested, able to take initiative, heads and facilitators. They were trained within various training activities organised within the projects of Association "EFA in Kazakhstan" supported by UNESCO, Bangkok and UNESCO, Almaty (in 2 CLCs due to turn over of staff new heads and facilitators were recruited).
7. Operational planning and documentation of CLCs is implemented in accordance to recommendations of project coordinators.

To the aspects of work that **have not found their solution** first of all can be referred the following issues:

1. Lack of funding required for implementing the programmes and due to this lack of confidence in sustainable autonomous development of minimum three Centres (Amanbokter, Nogaibai and Taraz). Non availability of juridical status with the majority of CLCs does not allow them to render chargeable services to the population and raise funds for covering salaries of trainers and maintaining equipment.
2. CLCs have difficulties in developing partnership and networking, coordination and sharing information. Development of partnership, especially with business structures, training institutions, NGOs provides good potential for their sustainable development. However this aspect of their activity is not implemented in a targeted way, is limited and uneven mainly due to the lack of experience of CLC facilitators and due to their underestimation of this dimension for building capacity of CLCs. Involvement of local wisdom (skilled craftsmen, collectioners, other fans) is insufficient.
3. Democratic principles have not become a key principle in the operation of the majority of CLCs. CLC Committees are not proactive. They do not involve representatives of all stakeholders. There is no allocation of responsibilities among CLC Committee members, and, as a result, they don't have a responsible participation in the work of the Committee and CLC. In the activity of some CLCs very noticeable is their dependent on local authorities.
4. Overall management needs to be cardinally improved, starting with needs analysis of target groups and trainees, clear and concrete definition of mission, strategic planning to consistent study and assessment of the outcome.
5. Not all Centres are ready to provide information services interesting for community members at the time suitable for them and demanded by them (reading of books, watching TV satellite programmes, work in Internet, etc.). The range of services which might be interesting for youth and adults to involve them into various activities, organising their leisure time, developing their intellectual and physical abilities, creating an atmosphere of unity (sport, joint trips, dancing, singing, drama performances, making flower compositions, etc.) is rather limited.
6. Training services provided by individual CLCs has low quality and is limited in range. Therefore some of the programmes offered are not demanded by the population.

Certainly, the list of both strengths and weaknesses presented is not exhaustive. However this is not the objective of the present report. It was more important to answer the key question: "Was the project implemented fully and what is the potential of CLCs in further developing local communities in the 7 localities?" The answer to the first part of the question is clear – all components of the project

were implemented according to the Terms of Reference. In the course of its implementation a sociological study was conducted, various training activities implemented, including 5 seminars and 2 monitoring missions. 10 reports were prepared.

It is more difficult to answer the second part of the question as objectively, according to the initial intention, the educational and developmental potential of Centres was expected to be more considerable, able to generate visible positive changes in the life of local community. In reality the future of CLCs and their perspectives can develop as any socially oriented programme according to three scenarios: optimistic, pessimistic and realistic.

Optimistic variant is feasible due to availability of several conditions necessary for continuous capacity building – educational and cultural - of CLCs. National and international experience of developing non-formal education and similar social programmes, shows that for their sustainable and efficient development the following prerequisites are necessary:

- Enhancing image of the organization (among citizens, in mass media through positive publications, information campaigns, developing strategies for involving wider community, through dialogues on most vital needs of local community development);
- Increasing political and financial support by the state and individuals (contracts, projects, volunteerism, joint funds, membership fees, etc.);
- Strengthening financial independence and sustainability through contracts with public/non-governmental organizations and donors, receiving grants, rendering chargeable services, receiving charity donations, etc.;
- Availability and constant enhancing partnership/networking with interested organizations, coordination and sharing information between educational (sectoral) NGOs – local, national and international level, developed communication infrastructure;
- Increasing range of services provided to target groups and improving quality of the services;
- Widening involvement of target groups;
- Improving strategic planning, implementing result and client oriented management, monitoring and assessment;
- Establishing and developing systems of studying and analyzing local community training needs and their feedback to monitor the work process;
- Joining the network of other NGOs and associations, developing structures of democratic management.

As could be seen from the review of weaknesses of CLCs, the main part of the conditions listed above, have not been created. To achieve this they need time and additional resources. The majority of CLCs don't have these at their disposal at present.

Pessimistic forecast, or closure (stopping the activity) of the majority of CLCs is not possible as the basics for functioning of CLCs have already been created (premises, equipment, political support of local authorities, trained staff, etc.) which allow implementation of various training and other programmes demanded by local community. However, for individual CLCs (e.g. Amanbokter and Nogaibai CLCs) such unwanted perspective can become a reality without financial support from the local authorities and information and methodological assistance provided by Association "EFA in Kazakhstan" though they have a sufficient technical base.

On the whole, for the majority of CLC more feasible is a *realistic scenario*, which will be determined by **gradual** transition to autonomous operation. They need further actions aimed at increasing efficiency and variety of programmes and services offered, at reinforcing and development of the results achieved. The main of them are:

- Widening of the range of services offered, sustaining focus on disadvantaged, needy families, introduction of chargeable services for successful groups of population (their cost should be lower than the market costs for similar services).
- Implementation of democratic principles of management, transformation of the activity of CLC Committees, interaction with Akimats. The CLCs who have not succeeded in establishing good relations should strengthen their activities in this direction. Those who have established good relationship with local authorities should take care not to become very dependent on them which might have an impact on making decisions related to training local community).
- Improving strategic planning, conducting regular needs assessment and accordingly modifying programmes.
- Conducting targeted advertising and information campaigns to attract more people to participating in the CLC activities and getting more support from the state and business structures.
- Establishing and strengthening networking and partnership, information exchange with interested organizations on the local, national and international level. Development of joint projects to raise additional funds and get access to information resources.

Emphasizing the necessity of gradual strengthening of CLCs we take into account the development of NGOs in Kazakhstan, operating in the educational area in Kazakhstan at present. Their experience shows that process of sustainable development (including identification of target groups, elaboration of strategy, capacity building of experts, fund raising ability, cooperation with national and regional authorities, establishing partnership relations, etc.) takes time, over 3-4 years. We exclude from this process the first year of establishing Centres during which the CLC staff were involved mainly in technical aspects of work – preparing premises, installing equipment and so on. This means that CLCs were engaged in the real work with local community during a year and a half. It is evident, that during such a short time it is practically impossible to ensure that all conditions are available for sustainable and autonomous functioning, especially in the rural area.

In our view, for enhancing their status, extending the range of services and target groups, CLCs need continuing of further financial, technical, information and training support at least for one year both on behalf of UNESCO and Association “EFA in Kazakhstan” as well as from the side of national, oblast and especially local organs. Such support would enable them in a shorter time to become the Centres whose activities could be directed to improving quality of life of local community through involving community members in various training, income generation, cultural, health and other activities.

Annex

Annex 1

Questionnaire for self-assessment of CLC education work

1. General data about CLC

- 1.1. Name of CLC
- 1.2. Name of head (facilitator)
- 1.3. Address (with mail index)
- 1.4. Telephone/fax
- 1.5. Name of CLC Committee Chairman
- 1.6. Date and basic measures launched on previous monitoring outcomes

2. Educational material resources

- 2.1. State of equipment
- 2.2. Supply of audio and video education tools
- 2.3. Library fund

3. Trainees

Quantity of groups and trainees in 2005

- 3.1. Quantity of trainees on realizable projects in CLC

Curriculum	Men	Women	Total
1			
2			
etc.			
Total			

- 3.2. Quantity of trainees from needy families

3.3. Attendance of lessons. **Good (100%). Satisfactory (75%). Unsatisfactory (less than 50%).**
Underline the chosen one.

3.4. Changes in quantity of trainees in last year: **Increasing. Sustainable. Decreasing.** Underline the chosen one.

4. Staff. Quality and quantity content of trainers.

5. Finances.

#	Incomes	2005	Forecast to next year
1.	Main budget		
2.	Grants		
3.	Incomes from building (lodge) rent		
4.	Incomes from education service - payable service - education by agreements with placement service		
5.	Income from production activity		
6.	Sponsor aide from legal entities and persons		

6. External affairs

7. Availability of documents regulating CLC activity, including:

- 7.1. Year working plan
- 7.2. Operation working plans
- 7.3. Schedule of lessons, their periodicity
- 7.4. Journal of lessons registration
- 7.5. Courses and lessons curriculums

8. Planning

#	Direction and questions	Sources of information	Grades			Proposals on further development
			Yes	No	Partly	
1. Planned objectives						
1.1.	Are mission, objectives and tasks clear formulated?	Documents on planning				
1.2.	Are mission, objectives and tasks certain to CLC Committee	Surveys				
1.3.	Are mission, objectives and tasks completely reflected in curriculums?	Curriculums				
1.4.	Is achievement of given objectives and tasks constantly controlled and is this information used for CLC activity improvement?	Reports, documents on planning				
1.5.	Is effectiveness of education study?	Surveys				
2. Curriculums						
2.1.	Availability of curriculums	Curriculums				
2.2.	Is number of new seminars enough for providing additional needs of trainees from target groups?					
2.3.	Is there clear structure of courses coming from objectives and missions of CLC ?					
2.4	Is content of curriculums corresponds to needs of trainees from local community?					
2.5.	Is development of social, vocational, entrepreneurial and computer skills reflected enough in education documents?					
3. Technology of education process						
3.1.	Are methods of realizing person-oriented education applied, including:	Curriculums, trainees and trainers surveys				

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • formation of positive attitude to education • problem arrangement of education and practical work tasks • calculation of previous experience, knowledge and skills of trainees • organization of self-dependant education in small groups • Trainees self-assessment of process and results of education activity 					
3.2.	Are methods and tools of education change depending on efficiency and needs of trainees?	Same sources				

Programme of round table
“Community Learning Centres in Kazakhstan – opportunities for sustainable development”

Venue: Almaty, Chaikovskiy st., VET school №18

Objectives:

- Discussion of outcomes of CLC activity monitoring
- Determination of project of local joint activity for providing self-dependant sustainable development of CLC

Expected outcomes:

Project of acting plan of CLCs committees on further improvement of CLC work and providing of its sustainable institution development.

June 28	
10.00 - 10.10	Opening. Participants welcome.
10.10 - 10.20	Familiarizing with objectives and programme of round table.
10.20 - 11.00	Presentation and discussion of CLC monitoring outcomes (May-June 2005)
11.00 - 1.20	Break.
11.20 -12.00	Discussion of monitoring outcomes, general discussion.
12.00 - 12.40	Presentation of international experience of CLC work, discussion.
12.40 - 13.00	Work in group (on CLC presentations).
13.00 – 14.00	Lunch.
14.00 – 15.00	Presentations of CLC heads on realization of measures on monitoring outcomes.
15.00 – 17.00	Perspectives of further sustainable CLC development – general discussion. Elaboration of recommendations on further improvement of working forms, expansion of CLC education types.
17.30 – 18.00	Summing up the outcomes of round table meeting. Individual consulting.

List of round table invitees
“Community Learning Centres in Kazakhstan – opportunities for sustainable development”

Almaty, VET school № 18 Chaikovskiy st. 7.
June 28, 2005.

	First, last and middle name, position	Organization	Address, telephone, fax
1	Sheshmukhanova Anar – head of department of international programmes development	Department of education development strategy and international cooperation of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan	010000, Astana, Republic av. 24, tel. 8 3172 333407
2	Khalafova Aigul - education specialist	UNESCO Cluster office, Almaty	050091, Almaty, Tole bi st., 67. tel. 3272 796035, fax 794853
3	Zhaitapova Altynai – deputy director	Republican Institute for up-grading skills of academic and administrative staff of education	050020, Almaty, Mitin st., 6. tel. 3272 645844, 646560
4	Tasbulatova Shaizada – director	Association “Education for all in Kazakhstan”/ National Observatory	050020, Almaty, Mitin st., 6. tel. 3272 641286, 650007, e-mail: shaizada@nursat.kz
5	Belosludtseva Valentina – expert		
6	Kadyrova Saltanat - expert		
7	Khassenova Aigul - expert		
8	Begalinova Natalya – accountant		
Almaty oblast			
9	Zhaishibekova Kulimkhan – deputy director of internal policy department	Akimat of Almaty oblast	488000, Almaty oblast, Taldykorgan Tauelsizdik st., 38. tel.: 8 3282 272425, fax: 8 3282 247722, dwp@hotmail.kz , dwp@almaty-rcg.kz
10	Akhimbekova Shamshabanu – chairman		Almaty oblast, Taldykorgan Tauelsizdik st, 35. Тел: 32822 43592. aischrk@list.ru
11	Mamanbayev Galymzhan – deputy akim	Akimat of Sarkand oblast	Almaty oblast, Sarkand, Тел.: 8 32839 21353
12	Alpysbayev Kuat - deputy akim	Akimat of Eskeldi raion	489130, Almaty oblast, Karabulak village Orazbekov st., 69. tel.: 8 32836
13	Zheksenov Kadyrzhan - akim	Akimat of Karabulak village district	489130, Almaty oblast, Karabulak village Orazbekov st., 69. tel.: 8

			32836 30235
14	Kim Galina – facilitator	Karabulak CLC	489130, Almaty oblast, Eskeldi raion, Karabulak village Orazbekov st., 65. tel. (32836) 30959/ Karabulakclc@mail.kz ,
15	Kesikbayeva Meirkhan – akim	Akimat of Amanbokter village	489232, Almaty oblast, Sarkand raion, Amanbokter village, Lenin st., 8. tel. 8 (32839) 22243
16	Mamayeva Zhanar – facilitator	Amanbokter CLC	489232, Almaty oblast, Sarkand raion, Amanbokter village, Lenin st., 8. tel. 8 (32839) 22481, e-mail Sarkandclc@mail.kz
Zhambyl oblast			
17	Uisenbayev Erkin – chief specialist of youth department	Akimat of Zhambyl oblast	080008. Taraz, Abai av., 125. tel.: 8 3262 430854, fax: 8 3262 455573, 457620.
18	Strizhakova Polina – head of department	Akimat of Korday oblast	485610, Zhambyl oblast, Kordai raion, Kordai village, tel: 8 32636 22190.
19	Karamoldayeva Bayan - head	Department of labor, employment and social defense of Korday raion	485610, Zhambyl oblast, Kordai raion, Kordai village, Tole bi st., 48. tel: 8 32636 21281.
20	Bakhtayeva Indira - facilitator	CLC of Kordai	485610, Zhambyl oblast, Kordai raion, Kordai village, Tole bi st., 48, tel. 8 32636 21249, e-mail Kordaicomc@mail.kz
21	Turmakhambetova Rakhiya – akim	Akimat of Nogibai village	485620, Zhambyl oblast, Kordai raion, Nogaibaii village, Kozhakhmetuly st., 8. tel. 8 32636 27219.
22	Abdullin Ayan – facilitator	CLC of of Nogibai village	485620, Zhambyl oblast, Kordai raion, Nogaibaii village, Kozhakhmetuly st., 8.tel. 8 32636 27342. Nogaibaicomc@nursat.kz
23	Abdyldayev Talaibek - akim	Akimat of Sortobe village	485624, Zhambyl oblast, Kordai raion, Sortobe village, Lenin st., 152. Тел. 8 32636 31200
24	Ersa Amina - facilitator	CLC of Sortobe village	485624, Zhambyl oblast, Kordai raion, Sortobe village, Lenin st, 152, тел. (32636) 31200/ Sortobecomc@nursat.kz
25	Mustafev Ermek – president	Public union “Youth supporting	484048, Taraz, 7

		fund”	microraion, 14 r. 2. tel: 8 3262 435536. oo-moi@nursat.kz
26	Khairusheva Zhanar – facilitator	CLC of Taraz	484048, Taraz, 7 microraion, 14 r. 2, tel (3262) 76948, e-mail Tarazclc@nursat.kz
Karaganda			
27	Bezginova Zinaida – deputy akim, chairman of CLC Committee	Akimat of Okober raion	470003, Karaganda, Magnitogorskaya st., 24. tel: 8 3212 457356
28	Ivchenko Gennadiy – director	VET school № 1	e-mail: kgclc@nursat.kz
29	Yugay Gennadiy – facilitator	CLC of Karaganda	